

PATRICK J. CRONIN, WSBA No. 28254
WINSTON & CASHATT
1900 Bank of America Financial Center
601 W. Riverside Ave.
Spokane, WA 99201
Telephone: (509) 838-6131

Attorneys for Defendants

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON

MARK A. HOLUM, an individual,)
)
Plaintiff,)

vs.)

No. CV-08-081-EFS

EXTENDICARE HOMES, INC., a)
corporation; EXTENDICARE)
HEALTH SERVICES, INC., a)
corporation; and EXTENDICARE)
HEALTH FACILITIES, INC., a)
corporation,)
Defendants.)

DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO STRIKE
PORTIONS OF THE DECLARATION
OF MARK HOLUM

1. Relief Requested.

The defendants request that the following portions of Mark Holum's Declaration submitted in opposition to motion for summary judgment be stricken, and not considered in response to defendants' summary judgment.

DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO STRIKE
PORTIONS OF THE DECLARATION OF MARK
HOLUM -- 1

LAW OFFICES OF
Winston & Cashatt
1900 SEAFIRST FINANCIAL CENTER
SPOKANE, WASHINGTON 99201
(509) 838-6131

1 **2. Basis for Motion.**

2 A party opposing summary judgment must present admissible evidence to
3 defeat the motion; opposing affidavits must be based on personal knowledge, set out
4 facts admissible in evidence, and show that the affiant is competent to testify to the
5 matters stated. FRCP 56(c). To offer an expert opinion, the witness must be qualified
6 as an expert by knowledge, skill, experience, training or education. FRE 702. A
7 nurse or caregiver is not qualified to render medical diagnoses.
8
9

10 Testimony which is irrelevant is inadmissible, as are conclusions of law or
11 speculative or conclusory statutes. FRE 402; Soremekum v. Thrifty Payless, Inc., 509
12 F.3d 978 (9th Cir. 2007). Testimony that contains out of court assertions that are
13 meant to prove the truth of the matter asserted are also inadmissible. FRE 802.
14 Moreover, testimony that is directly contradictory to contemporaneous medical
15 records cannot create an issue of fact for trial. Chima v. Obedoza, 72 Fed. Appx. 577,
16 2003 WL 21771927 (9th Cir. 2003).
17

18 The portions of Mr. Holum's testimony contained in his Declaration which
19 should be stricken based on the above law are outlined below.
20
21
22
23
24

3. Portions of the Declaration to be stricken:

Paragraph 10

Lack of personal knowledge, lack of foundation, lack of qualification to render expert opinion, conclusory, speculative.

Mr. Holum's speculative conclusions on what type of care The Gardens can give based on medical diagnoses, and the type of training others at The Gardens may have had lacks any foundation, or qualifications necessary to render an expert opinion.

Paragraph 14

Relevance, speculative.

Mr. Holum's speculation on events that did not occur are irrelevant and inadmissible.

Paragraph 17

Lack of foundation, lack of qualifications to render expert opinion.

Mr. Holum fails to identify any foundation he has for testifying on federal laws, fails to identify the federal laws, and fails to identify any expertise necessary to render an expert legal opinion.

///

///

///

///

1 **4. Conclusion.**

2 Fore the foregoing reasons, plaintiff requests that the court strike the portions of
3 Mr. Holum's Declaration.
4

5 DATED this 27th day of January, 2009.

6 s/Patrick J. Cronin, WSBA No. 28254
7 WINSTON & CASHATT
8 Attorneys for Defendants
9 601 W. Riverside, Ste. 1900
10 Spokane, WA 99201
11 (509) 838-6131
12 Facsimile: (509) 838-1416
13 E-mail Address: pjc@winstoncashatt.com
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

1 I hereby certify that on January 27, 2009, I electronically filed the foregoing
2 with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF System which will send notification of
3 such filing to the following:
4

5 Marcia M. Meade
6 Dawson & Meade
7 m@d-mlaw.com

8 Robert F. Greer, II
9 rfgreer@fggzlaw.com

10 Attorney for Plaintiff Mark A. Holum

11 s/Patrick J. Cronin, WSBA No. 28254
12 WINSTON & CASHATT
13 Attorneys for Defendants
14 601 W. Riverside, Ste. 1900
15 Spokane, WA 99201
16 (509) 838-6131
17 Facsimile: (509) 838-1416
18 E-mail Address: pjc@winstoncashatt.com

19 144633

20
21
22
23
24
DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO STRIKE
PORTIONS OF THE DECLARATION OF MARK
HOLUM -- 5

LAW OFFICES OF
Winston & Cashatt
1900 SEAFIRST FINANCIAL CENTER
SPOKANE, WASHINGTON 99201
(509) 838-6131